

Report Identification Number: NY-19-099

Prepared by: New York City Regional Office

Issue Date: Feb 20, 2020

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns: A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships						
BM-Biological Mother		SC-Subject Child				
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child				
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father				
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider				
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father				
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle				
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub				
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult					
	Contacts					
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner				
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services				
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother				
CPS-Child Protective Services						
	Allegations					
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts				
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding				
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse				
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect				
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive				
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision				
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other					
	Miscellaneous					
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender				
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence				
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police				
Service	Services	Department				
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families	FC-Foster Care				
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services				
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan				
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment				
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old				
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation	ASTO-Allowing Sex Abuse to Occur					



Case Information

Report Type: Child Found Alive Jurisdiction: Bronx Date of Death: Unknown

Age: 15 year(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 08/23/2019

Presenting Information

The 8/23/19 SCR report alleged the SM jumped off the 20th floor of her apartment building while holding the 5-year-old half sibling in her arms. The 15-year-old SC subsequently jumped off the building. It was alleged that as a result of the fall, the SM, SC, and the 5-year-old half sibling died. The roles of the two half siblings were unknown.

Executive Summary

According to the 8/23/19 report, the SM jumped off the 20th floor of her apartment building while holding the 5-year-old half sibling in her arms. The 15-year-old SC subsequently jumped off the building. It was alleged that as a result of the fall, the SM, SC, and the 5-year-old half sibling died. ACS investigated the report and found the two children, who were referenced in the report, were found alive.

The 8/23/19 report included the allegations of DOA/Fatality and IG of the half-sibling (age 5) and SC (age 15) by the SM.

During the investigation, ACS made pertinent collateral contacts with neighbors, LE, CAC, foster care agency CP, and domestic violence, mental health and investigative consultants. A neighbor did not express any concerns for the children at the case address. ACS conducted a conference call meeting with the foster care agency, and the investigating team to discuss the family's services and compliance.

The ACS investigating team maintained ongoing collaboration with the provider agencies. ACS conducted multiple announced and unannounced home visits, observed the children and verified they were healthy. The children did not have suspicious marks/bruises.

ACS contacted the children's medical providers and reported that the children had no medical illnesses that required daily medication.

On 10/21/19, ACS unsubstantiated the allegations of DOA/Fatality and IG of the 5-year-old half sibling and 15-year-old SC by the SM on the basis the children were found alive. ACS unsubstantiated the other allegations of the 8/23/19 report on the basis of no credible evidence. ACS noted there was no information obtained throughout the investigation that reflected children were found dead at the case address listed in the report.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:

- Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:
 - Approved Initial Safety Assessment?

Yes



Safety assessment due at the time of determination?

Yes

• Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate?

Yes

Determination:

• Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?

Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.

• Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?

Yes

Explain:

Sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.

Was the decision to close the case appropriate?

N/A

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory Yes

or regulatory requirements?

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?

Yes, the case record has detail of the

consultation.

Explain:

ACS obtained relevant information from the collateral contacts.

Required Actions Related to the Fatality

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Issue:	Failure to Conduct a Face-to-Face Interview (Subject/Family)
Summary:	There were no face-to-face interviews or assessments of the SM, SC and father of 5-year-old half sibling reflected or documented in the 8/23/19 investigation progress notes.
Legal Reference:	18 NYCRR 432.2(b)(3)(ii)(a)
Action	ACS must submit a PIP within 45 days that identifies the action the agency has taken or will take to address the citations identified in the fatality report. ACS must meet with the staff involved with this fatality investigation and inform NYCRO of the date of the meeting, who attended and what was discussed.

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship Role		Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	15 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	33 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Other Child - Half Sibling	Alleged Victim	Male	9 Year(s)

NY-19-099 FINAL Page 4 of 19



Deceased Child's Household	Other Child - Half Sibling	Alleged Victim	Male	8 Month(s)
Other Household 1	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling Father	Alleged Perpetrator	Male	35 Year(s)
Other Household 2	Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling	Alleged Victim	Female	5 Year(s)

LDSS Response

Between 8/23/19 and 8/26/19, ACS initiated the investigation and learned there were no physical injuries noted for the subject children. ACS investigating team convened a Heightened Oversight Conference to discuss the case; thereafter, the investigating team created a plan to visit the home and assess the subject family. ACS visited the SM and children at the BF's residence. ACS observed the children and noted they had no marks or bruises. At the time, ACS reported that the family was alive.

On 8/26/19, ACS met with the SM and her children at the LDSS office. The investigating team reviewed the active OOP pertaining to the father of the half-sibling (age 5). The ACS team escorted the SM to her local precinct to file a report. ACS assessed the children and did not observe visible marks or bruises on the children's bodies.

On 8/26/19, ACS learned that the father of the half-sibling (age 5) was arrested for violating the OOP and was charged with aggravated harassment and criminal content. The SM said she planned to testify and participate in the prosecution attempt.

On 8/28/19, ACS met with the mental health and domestic violence consultants to assess the case and based on the case material and finding, the consultant recommended utilizing completed DV protocol and obtaining information about the family's mental health services.

On 9/10/19, ACS learned that LE requested CAC interviews of the children in the home. The SM reported that a consult would be made with the attorney's for children to discuss the CAC appointments.

ACS obtained relevant information from the neighbors, LE, CAC, foster care agency CP, domestic violence, mental health and investigative consultants. A neighbor did not express any concerns for the children at the case address. ACS conducted a conference call meeting with the foster care agency to discuss the family's services and compliance. ACS conducted multiple announced and unannounced home visits and observed the children. The children were in good health and they were free of marks and bruises. ACS contacted the medical providers and verified the children had no medical illnesses that required daily medication.

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? No

Comments: The children reported on this fatality were found alive.

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? No

Comments: There is no OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team in the New York City region.

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation
			Outcome

NY-19-099 FINAL Page 5 of 19



053012 - Deceased Child, Male, 15 Yrs	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Childs Drug / Alcohol Use	Unsubstantiated
053012 - Deceased Child, Male, 15 Yrs	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
053012 - Deceased Child, Male, 15 Yrs	053024 - Other Adult - Female Half Sibling Father, Male, 35 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
053012 - Deceased Child, Male, 15 Yrs	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated
053012 - Deceased Child, Male, 15 Yrs	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Unsubstantiated
053012 - Deceased Child, Male, 15 Yrs	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
053021 - Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 9 Year(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Unsubstantiated
053021 - Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 9 Year(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated
053021 - Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 9 Year(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
053021 - Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 9 Year(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Choking / Twisting / Shaking	Unsubstantiated
053021 - Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 9 Year(s)	053024 - Other Adult - Female Half Sibling Father, Male, 35 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
053022 - Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Month(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated
053022 - Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Month(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Unsubstantiated
053022 - Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Month(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Childs Drug / Alcohol Use	Unsubstantiated
053022 - Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Month(s)	053024 - Other Adult - Female Half Sibling Father, Male, 35 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
053022 - Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Month(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
053022 - Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Month(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Unsubstantiated
053301 - Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 5 Year(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
053301 - Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 5 Year(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Allowing Sex Abuse to Occur	Unsubstantiated
053301 - Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 5 Year(s)	053023 - Mother, Female, 33 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	\boxtimes			

NY-19-099 FINAL Page 6 of 19



When appropriate, children were interviewed?		\boxtimes		
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?				
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?		\boxtimes		
Contact with source?				
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	\boxtimes			
Was a death-scene investigation performed?			\boxtimes	
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?				
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	\boxtimes			
Did the investigation adhere to established protocols for a joint investigation?				
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?		\boxtimes		
Additional information: The SCHN, SM and father of 5-year-old half sibling's assessments were not do	cumented	in the 8/2	3/19 inves	stigation.
Fatality Safety Assessment Activities				
				l
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	Yes 🖂	No	N/A	
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to s				Determine
				Determine
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report: Within 24 hours?	surviving			Determine
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report:	Surviving			Determine
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report: Within 24 hours? At 7 days?	Surviving			Determine
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report: Within 24 hours? At 7 days? At 30 days? Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving	surviving			Determine
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report: Within 24 hours? At 7 days? At 30 days? Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours? Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local	surviving	siblings/d		Determine
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report: Within 24 hours? At 7 days? At 30 days? Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours? Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district? When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?	Surviving Surviving	siblings/d		Determine
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report: Within 24 hours? At 7 days? At 30 days? Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours? Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district? When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions	Surviving Surviving	siblings/d		Determine

NY-19-099 FINAL Page 7 of 19



Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate	in this case	?					
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household?							
Was there an adequate assessment of the	e family's n	eed for se	rvices?	\boxtimes			
Did the protective factors in this case rein Family Court at any time during or a	-		-				
Were appropriate/needed services offere	ed in this ca	ase		\boxtimes			
Explain: The family engaged in preventive services	, mental hea	alth counse	ling and hom	nemaking s	services.		
Placement	Activities in	Response to	the Fatality	Investigation	on		
				Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving siblings/other children in the household be removed or placed in foster care at any time during this fatality investigation?					\boxtimes		
Were there surviving children in the hou as a result of this fatality report / investito this fatality?							
Explain as necessary: The children were found alive.							
	Legal Activ	vity Related	to the Fatalit	V			
Was there legal activity as a result of the	fatality inv			-	ctivity.		
Have any Orders of Protection been issu	ued? No						
Services F	Provided to t	he Family in	Response to	the Fatality	y		
Services Provided Offered, Offered, After but Unknown Death Refused if Used					Needed but Unavailal	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling							
Economic support							
Funeral arrangements							
Housing assistance							
Mental health services							
Foster care							

NEW YORK STATE	Office of Children and Family Services
----------------------	--

Health care			\boxtimes	
Legal services			\boxtimes	
Family planning				
Homemaking Services				
Parenting Skills			\boxtimes	
Domestic Violence Services			\boxtimes	
Early Intervention			\boxtimes	
Alcohol/Substance abuse			\boxtimes	
Child Care			\boxtimes	
Intensive case management			\boxtimes	
Family or others as safety resources			\boxtimes	
Other			\boxtimes	
Additional information, if necessary: The family received preventive services.				

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? N/A

Explain:

The children were found alive.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? N/A

Explain:

The children were found alive.

History Prior to the Fatality

Child Information

Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment? Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death? Yes Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death? No No

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
08/15/2019	C,	Other Adult - BF Female Half Sibling , Male, 35 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	No

NY-19-099 FINAL Page 9 of 19



Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 5 Years	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Months	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Childs Drug / Alcohol Use	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Months	Other Adult - BF Female Half Sibling, Male, 35 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Months	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Months	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Months	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Months	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Deceased Child on Report, Male, 15 Years	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Childs Drug / Alcohol Use	Unsubstantiated
Deceased Child on Report, Male, 15 Years	Other Adult - BF Female Half Sibling, Male, 35 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Deceased Child on Report, Male, 15 Years	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Deceased Child on Report, Male, 15 Years	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated
Deceased Child on Report, Male, 15 Years	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Unsubstantiated
Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 5 Years	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Allowing Sex Abuse to Occur	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Years	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Choking / Twisting / Shaking	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Years	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Years	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 8 Years	Mother, Female, 33 Years	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Unsubstantiated

Report Summary:

The 8/15/19 report alleged on an ongoing basis, the SM smoked marijuana while being the sole caregiver of 15-year-old, 8-year-old, and the 8-month-old children. The SM blew smoke in the children's faces. The SM became impaired and was unable to care for the children. The SM and 15-year-old SC smoked marijuana together to the point where he became impaired. The SM left the 8-year-old and the 8-month-old at home with the 15-year-old while he was inebriated.

Report Determination: Unfounded Date of Determination: 10/11/2019

Basis for Determination:

During the 8/15/19 investigation, ACS found there was no credible evidence to substantiate the allegations of the report. ACS interviewed the subject children who said they had not witnessed the SM smoke anything in the home nor had she blown smoke in the 8-month-old child's face. There were allegations pertaining to the SM from anonymous reports that

NY-19-099 FINAL Page 10 of 19



were called against the SM. The allegations ranged from excessive corporal punishment to suicide and fatality. According to ACS, all reports have been false and malicious.

OCFS Review Results:

During the investigation ACS assessed the SM's and the PGM's home (both homes were assessed to be safe, and proper provisions for the children were observed through announced and unannounced home visits). ACS created a safety plan with the SM and the children. ACS obtained relevant information from the MA, PGM, physicians, foster care agency, building management and neighbors. ACS contacted other district agency staff assigned to monitor the half sibling's foster home. ACS interviewed the BF and attempted to contact the father of the half sibling. ACS sought legal intervention and an order of protection for the SM and children.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
12/13/2018	Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 14 Days	Mother, Female, 32 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated	Yes

Report Summary:

The 12/13/18 report alleged the SM gave birth to a male child. The SM's other children were removed from the SM's care and placed in foster care. The child (age 14), fathers of the unknown named child, and child (age 14) had unknown roles.

Report Determination: Indicated **Date of Determination:** 02/12/2019

Basis for Determination:

During the 12/13/18 investigation, ACS found credible evidence to substantiate the allegation of IG of the infant by the SM. The investigative findings showed the SM admitted she hid her pregnancy from the foster care agency and as a result she missed supervised visits with her children. Due to the SM's history and her non-compliance with the foster care agency, an Article Ten Neglect Petition was filed against the SM due to derivative neglect.

OCFS Review Results:

ACS obtained information from the foster care agency, made referrals for MH consultations and followed up with the infant's medical provider. ACS interviewed the child (age 14) and visited his school. ACS documented safe sleep discussion with the SM. ACS interviewed the father of the child (age 14). The SM refused to provide information about the father of the infant. The progress notes were not written contemporaneously. Several of the supervisory directives were not followed or were incomplete at the closure of the investigation, (including directives to follow-up and document pertinent investigative information in the Family Services Progress Notes).

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? XYes No

Issue:

Timely/Adequate Case Recording/Progress Notes

Summary:

The progress notes in the 12/13/18 investigation were not entered contemporaneously. An event occurred on 1/9/19 and the note was entered on 2/11/19.

Legal Reference:

18 NYCRR 428.5

Action:

ACS must submit a PIP within 45 days that identifies the action the agency has taken or will take to address the citations identified in the fatality report. ACS must meet with the staff involved with this fatality investigation and inform NYCRO of the date of the meeting, who attended and what was discussed.

NY-19-099 FINAL Page 11 of 19



Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
07/24/2018	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated	No
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Lack of Medical Care	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 14 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 14 Years	Mother, Female, 32 Years	Childs Drug / Alcohol Use	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 14 Years	Mother, Female, 32 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 14 Years	Mother, Female, 32 Years	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 14 Years	Mother, Female, 32 Years	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 12 Years	Mother, Female, 32 Years	Childs Drug / Alcohol Use	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 12 Years	Mother, Female, 32 Years	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Male, 11 Years	Mother, Female, 32 Years	Childs Drug / Alcohol Use	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Male, 11 Years	Mother, Female, 32 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Male, 11 Years	Mother, Female, 32 Years	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 12 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 12 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 12 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Male, 11 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Male, 11 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Male, 11 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Unsubstantiated	
	Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 7 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 7 Years	Other Adult - Female Half Sibling BF, Male, 34 Years	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated	

NY-19-099 FINAL Page 12 of 19



5,		Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Unsubstantiated
Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 4 Years	l .	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 4 Years	IN/lother Hemale 4/ Vears	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated

Report Summary:

The 7/24/2018 report alleged the SM rolled marijuana for the SSs (14) and (11). The stepparent intervened and the SM and SSs became upset and physically assaulted the stepparent. The stepparent's role was unknown.

Report Determination: Indicated **Date of Determination:** 09/21/2018

Basis for Determination:

ACS found there was credible evidence to substantiate the allegation of IG of the SC and SS by the father of the half sibling. The father of the half sibling assaulted the SM in the presence of the children.

ACS unsubstantiated the allegations of CD/A, L/B/W, PD/AM, LMC, IG, and LS of the SC by the SM and the father of the half sibling on the basis of no credible evidence.

OCFS Review Results:

During the investigation, ACS assessed the SM's homes and the PGM's home (both homes were assessed to be safe, and proper provisions for the children were observed through announced and unannounced home visits). ACS created a safety plan with the SM and children. ACS made pertinent collateral contact with the MA, PGM, physicians, foster care agency, building management and neighbors. ACS contacted other district agency staff assigned to monitor the half sibling's foster home. ACS interviewed the BF and attempted to contact the father of the half sibling. ACS sought legal intervention and an order of protection for the SM and children.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
04/27/2018	Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 4 Years	Mother, Female,	Inadequate	Unsubstantiated	Yes
	Female, 4 Years	32 Years	Guardianship		
	Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling,	Mother, Female,	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Ungubetentiated	
	Female, 4 Years	32 Years	/ Welts	Unsubstantiated	

Report Summary:

The 4/27/2018 report alleged on 4/18/18, the SM hit the female half sibling (age 4) with a hammer and a hanger leaving bruising on the half sibling's left arm. The SM had mental health issues and was not stable.

Report Determination: Unfounded **Date of Determination:** 06/26/2018

Basis for Determination:

During the 4/27/2018 investigation, ACS did not find credible evidence to substantiate the allegations of the report. The investigative findings showed the half sibling did not sustain injuries as a result of actions inflicted on her by the SM. The half sibling did not make disclosures of being hit by the SM. ACS observed the SM exercised a minimum degree of care in providing adequate guardianship to the half-sibling.

OCFS Review Results:

During the investigation, ACS assessed the SM, PGM, and foster parent's home (the homes were assessed to be safe with proper provisions for the children). ACS obtained relevant information from the foster parent, PGM, physicians, foster care agency, daycare provider/school, CAC, medical and investigative consultants. ACS did not interview the half sibling's father.

Are	tŀ	ıer	e I	⊀eq	uir	ed	Act	tions	re	late	ed	to) tl	he	con	ıpl	ianc	e	issu	e(s	:)?	' [\boxtimes	Yes	s L	IN	10
-----	----	-----	-----	-----	-----	----	-----	-------	----	------	----	----	------	----	-----	-----	------	---	------	-----	-----	------------	-------------	-----	-----	----	----



Issue:

Failure to Conduct a Face-to-Face Interview (Subject/Family)

Summary:

During the 4/27/18 investigation, ACS did not interview the half-sibling's father.

Legal Reference:

18 NYCRR 432.2(b)(3)(ii)(a)

Action:

ACS must submit a PIP within 45 days that identifies the action the agency has taken or will take to address the citations identified in the fatality report. ACS must meet with the staff involved with this fatality investigation and inform NYCRO of the date of the meeting, who attended and what was discussed.

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
06/13/2017	Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 3 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Excessive Corporal Punishment	Unsubstantiated	No
	Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 3 Years	Other Adult - Biological Father, Male, 56 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 3 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 3 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Poisoning / Noxious Substances	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 13 Years	Other Adult - Biological Father, Male, 56 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 10 Years	Other Adult - Biological Father, Male, 56 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Male, 9 Years	Other Adult - Biological Father, Male, 56 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 6 Years	Other Adult - Biological Father, Male, 56 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 13 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Excessive Corporal Punishment	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 13 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 13 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Poisoning / Noxious Substances	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 10 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Excessive Corporal Punishment	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 10 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 10 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Poisoning / Noxious Substances	Unsubstantiated	



Sibling, Male, 9 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Excessive Corporal Punishment	Unsubstantiated
Sibling, Male, 9 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Sibling, Male, 9 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Substances	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 6 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Excessive Corporal Punishment	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 6 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 6 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Poisoning / Noxious Substances	Unsubstantiated

Report Summary:

The 6/13/17 report alleged on 6/12/17 at 9:00 PM, the SM hit the SC along with his male siblings ages 10, 9 and 6. The SM threw objects in the home. The violence occurred frequently in the home and the father was unable to intervene to protect the children. The police responded often to the home. It was unknown if anyone was harmed during the 6/12/17 incident.

Report Determination: Unfounded **Date of Determination:** 06/19/2017

Basis for Determination:

ACS found there was no credible evidence to substantiate the allegations of the 6/13/17 report. The investigative findings showed the SC, and SSs ages 10 and 9, were in the care of the BF. The half siblings ages 6 and 3 were in non-kinship foster homes during the investigation. ACS did not observe marks or bruises on the children.

OCFS Review Results:

During the investigation, ACS was unable to merge into the existing 6/6/17 investigation due to technical issues. The 6/6/17 investigation had similar allegations. ACS documented the initial home visit and assessment of the BF's home. No other information was documented within the 6/13/17 investigation. The 6/13/17 investigation was subsequently closed on 6/19/17.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
06/06/2017	Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 3 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Excessive Corporal Punishment	Unsubstantiated	No
1	Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 3 Years	IN/Inther Hemale 31 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	
	Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 3 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Poisoning / Noxious Substances	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 13 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Excessive Corporal Punishment	Unsubstantiated	
	Deceased Child on Report, Male, 13 Years	IN/Inther Hemale 31 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	



Deceased Child on Report, Male, 13 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Poisoning / Noxious Substances	Unsubstantiated
Sibling, Female, 10 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Excessive Corporal Punishment	Unsubstantiated
Sibling, Female, 10 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Sibling, Female, 10 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Poisoning / Noxious Substances	Unsubstantiated
Sibling, Male, 9 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Excessive Corporal Punishment	Unsubstantiated
Sibling, Male, 9 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Sibling, Male, 9 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Poisoning / Noxious Substances	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 6 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Excessive Corporal Punishment	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 6 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 6 Years	Mother, Female, 31 Years	Poisoning / Noxious Substances	Unsubstantiated
Other Deceased Child - Half Sibling, Female, 3 Years	Other Adult - Biological Father, Male, 56 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Deceased Child on Report, Male, 13 Years	Other Adult - Biological Father, Male, 56 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Sibling, Female, 10 Years	Other Adult - Biological Father, Male, 56 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Sibling, Male, 9 Years	Other Adult - Biological Father, Male, 56 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
Other Child - Half Sibling, Male, 6 Years	Other Adult - Biological Father, Male, 56 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated

Report Summary:

The 6/6/2017 report alleged the SM had suicidal ideations and homicidal ideations while being the sole caretaker of SC (age 13), SSs ages (10 and 9), half sibling (age 6), and an unknown child. The report alleged on 6/6/17, the SM poisoned all five children and herself. It was unknown if the children sustained injuries as a result.

Report Determination: Unfounded Date of Determination: 07/24/2017

Basis for Determination:

During the 6/6/2017 investigation, ACS did not find credible evidence to substantiate the allegations of the report. The investigative findings showed the SC, and SSs ages 10 and 9, were in the care of their BF. The half siblings ages 6 and 3 were in non-kinship foster homes. The SC (age 13), SSs (ages 9 and 10) were medically cleared at the local hospital and there were no signs of physical abuse or poisoning. ACS did not observe marks or bruises on the children.

OCFS Review Results:

During the investigation, ACS assessed the BF and foster parent's home (both homes were assessed to be safe, and proper



provisions for the children were observed during announced and unannounced home visits). ACS obtained relevant
information from the physician, LE, foster care agency CP, and investigative consultants. ACS held a meeting with the
foster care agency to discuss the children's safety. ACS devised a plan to monitor the children's safety through supervised
agency visits.
Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? \(\sum \text{Ves} \) \(\sum \text{No}\)

CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality

The family had extensive prior history with ACS. The family's child welfare history began in 2006. The SM was an alleged subject in reports dated 6/29/06 (IND), 7/10/09 (IND), 8/3/10 (UNF), 9/24/10 (IND), 1/28/11 (IND), 8/6/11 (IND), 6/13/12 (UNF), 1/25/13 (IND), 4/23/13 (IND), 4/28/14 (IND), 10/31/14 (UNF), 4/20/15 (IND), and 6/27/15 (UNF). The allegations of these reports were a combination of EDN, M/FTTH, IG, L/B/W, IF/C/S, LMC and PD/AM.

Known CPS History Outside of NYS

There was no known CPS History outside of NYS.

Services Open at the Time of the Fatality

Was the deceased child(ren) involved in an open preventive services case at the time of the fatality? Yes Date the preventive services case was opened:

Was the deceased child(ren) involved in an open Child Protective Services case at the time of the fatality? Yes Date the Child Protective Services case was opened:

Evaluative Review of Services that were Open at the Time of the Fatality

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the service provider(s) comply with the timeliness and content requirements for progress notes?				
Did the services provided meet the service needs as outlined in the case record?	\boxtimes			
Did all service providers comply with mandated reporter requirements?	\boxtimes			
Was there information in the case record that indicated the existence of behaviors or conditions that placed the children in the case in danger or increased their risk of harm?				

Casework Contacts

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the service provider comply with case work contacts, including face-to-face contact as required by regulations pertaining to the program choice?				

Services Provided



		Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were services provided to siblings or other children in the housaddress any immediate needs and support their well-being in rethe fatality?					
Were services provided to parents as necessary to achieve safet permanency, and well-being?	y,				
E-miller American and Committee	2 DI (EAC	D)			
Family Assessment and Servi	ice Plan (FAS	P)			
		Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the most recent FASP approved on time?		\boxtimes			
Was there a current Risk Assessment Profile/Risk Assessment i recent FASP?	n the most				
Was the FASP consistent with the case circumstances?		\boxtimes			
Preventive Services	History				
9/23/13 and completed the program on 4/22/14. New Directions pro skills classes, individual psychotherapy and mental health services. domestic violence program on 5/18/16 and parenting education on 5 SCO and New York Foundling. An evaluation of case management were adequate as the subject family was assessed in the home and the compliant with all recommended services.	The father of /3/16. The surevealed AC	the half abject fan S, New Y	sibling (ag nily receiv York Foun	ge 5) comp yed service dling, and	oleted es from ACS, SCO visits
Foster Care Placemen	t History				
The half sibling (age 9) was placed in non-kinship foster care in Febthe SM and father of the half-sibling (age 5).	oruary 2013,	due to do	mestic vic	olence, IG	, PD/AM by
The half sibling (age 5) was placed in non-kinship foster care in Ma health services. The SM continued to engage in domestic violence was in the kinship home of her PGM at the time of the 8/23/19 ACS	vith the half-	siblings f		-	
Legal History Within Three Years	Prior to the	Fatality			
Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? ☐ Family Court ☐ Criminal Court ☐ Order of Protection					
Have any Orders of Protection been issued? Yes					
From: Unknown To: 1	0/29/2019				



Explain: The SM had an OP against the father of the half sibling (age 5	5).			
From: 12/14/2019	To: Unknown			
Explain: The PGM of the half sibling (age 5) had an OP against the SM.				
Recommended Action(s)				
Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? Yes No				
Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? Yes No				