

Report Identification Number: NY-19-071

Prepared by: New York City Regional Office

Issue Date: Dec 18, 2019

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns: A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships						
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child				
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child				
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father				
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider				
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father				
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle				
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub				
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult					
	Contacts					
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner				
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services				
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother				
CPS-Child Protective Services						
	Allegations					
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts				
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding				
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse				
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect				
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive				
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision				
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other					
	Miscellaneous					
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender				
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence				
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police				
Service	Services	Department				
PPRS-Purchased Preventive	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy	FC-Foster Care				
Rehabilitative Services	Families					
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services				
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan				
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment				
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old				
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation						



Case Information

Report Type: Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** New York **Date of Death:** 06/21/2019

Age: 2 month(s) Gender: Female Initial Date OCFS Notified: 06/21/2019

Presenting Information

On 5/22/19, at approximately 12:00 PM, the SM was giving the SC a bath in an infant bathtub, within the apartment bathtub. The MGM was also in the bathroom while the SC was receiving a bath. The SM stepped away to get a towel and left the SC in the tub. The SM did not adequately supervise the SC and the MGM did not adequately attend to the SC while she was still left in the bathtub. As a result, the SC was submerged under the water, facing up for approximately 30 seconds. The SM then performed CPR on the SC while the MGM called EMS; however, the SC was pale at this point. The SC was pronounced brain dead between the dates of 5/22/19 and 6/21/19, and was placed on life support during this period. The SC was removed from life support on 6/21/19 and pronounced dead at 9:32 AM. The cause of death was hypoxic ischmic encephalopathy, which is a consequence of drowning.

The allegations of this report were DOA/ fatality, LS and IG by the SM and MGM.

Executive Summary

The two-month-old SC child had been hospitalized in the Pediatric Intensive Care Unit (PICU), in the Morgan Stanley Children's Hospital, of New York Presbyterian Hospital (NYPH) for one month. She had been in a vegetative state and prognosis was poor, the parents opted to remove the life support.

The SC became known to ACS Manhattan Field Office on 5/22/19, when the SCR registered a report that alleged the SM left the SC unattended in a bathtub with running water for an unspecified amount of time. The SM returned to find the SC submerged. The SM contacted 911 who responded and transported the SM and SC to Mount Sinai Hospital. The SC was placed on life support and then transferred to the PICU in NYPH for closer attention.

ACS initiated the 5/22/19 report as they visited the hospital and confirmed the report. The Dr. reported the SC's prognosis was poor. The SM was reported to have been distraught but hopeful. The Dr. reported the BF was realistic about the SC's condition.

ACS learned from LE they found no criminality. The ME completed an external examination and reported the cause of death of the SC was complications of drowning and the manner was accidental. ACS interviewed the parents at the hospital and learned that although the BF resides in another state, the family is very close. The SM, SC, SS resided at the case address with the MGM. At the time the incident occurred, the SS was at school and the MGM was at work. ACS learned that the MGM was not at home at the time the incident occurred; however, the SCR report referred to the MGM as opposed to the MGGM, who was visiting the home and had fallen asleep. The MGGM is hearing and visually impaired as to the reason for her not responding to the SM's cry for help. The parents had a lot of family support. ACS also interviewed the family members such as the MGM, PGM, MU, MA and others. They all reported the SM to be a good mother who is caring and trusted with other children.

ACS received information from the SS's school that reflected he was academically on target, with good behavior and attendance. The Dr. reported the SS had no medical conditions and was up to date with immunizations. ACS offered services to the family; however, they declined. The SM and SS relocated out of state to live with the BF.

On 8/21/19, ACS indicated the allegation of the SC by the SM and unsubstantiated the allegations by the MGM.

NY-19-071 FINAL Page 3 of 10



County where fatality incident occurred:

Time of Call:

Was 911 or local emergency number called?

Child Fatality Report

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Date of fatal incident, if different than date of death: Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death:	05/22/2019 01:30 PM
Date of Death: 06/21/2019 Time of Death: 09:32	2 AM
Fatality-Related Information and Investigative	Acuvities
Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No Estality Polated Information and Investigative	Activities
Required Actions Related to the Fatality	
Explain: The family has relocated to another state.	
or regulatory requirements? Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?	Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.
Was the decision to close the case appropriate? Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory	Yes Yes
 Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate? 	Yes
 Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation? 	Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
appropriate?	
Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment	Yes
 Safety assessment due at the time of determination? 	Yes
 Approved Initial Safety Assessment? 	Yes
Safety Assessment: • Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:	

NY-19-071 FINAL Page 4 of 10

New York

01:45 PM

Yes



Did EMS respond to the sc	ene?	Yes
At time of incident leading	to death, had child used alcohol or drugs	No No
Child's activity at time of i	ncident:	
☐ Sleeping	Working	Driving / Vehicle occupant
☐ Playing	☐ Eating	Unknown
Other: Bathing		

Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to death? Yes

How long before incident was the child last seen by caretaker? 1 Minutes

At time of incident supervisor was: Not impaired.

Total number of deaths at incident event:

Children ages 0-18: 1
Adults: 0

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Female	2 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	No Role	Male	28 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Grandparent	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	62 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Grandparent	No Role	Female	96 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	28 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Male	10 Year(s)

LDSS Response

On 6/21/19, the SCR registered a report regarding the death of the two-month-old female SC that occurred on 6/21/19 as a result of having the life support system removed. The SC had been hospitalized in the Pediatric Intensive Care Unit, in the Morgan Stanley Children's Hospital, of New York Presbyterian Hospital (NYPH) in a vegetative state. This family first became known to ACS on 5/22/19 when the SCR registered a report. The report alleged that the SM was bathing the SC and left her in the bathtub, unattended for an unknown amount of time to fetch a towel. She returned to the bathroom and found the SC submerged in water, unresponsive. The SM called 911; EMS responded to the case address and transported the SC to Mount Sinai Hospital (MSH) where she was intubated and placed on a ventilator then transferred to NYPH.

The Specialist contacted MSH and NYPH and obtained information regarding the SC. The Specialist learned that the SC had no suspicious marks or bruises. The Specialist interviewed the SM who sobbed continuously; however, she was compliant. The SM explained she was bathing the SC in a baby tub which sat in the adult bathtub. She left the SC for approximately thirty seconds to fetch a towel. She explained she left the water running to keep the SC warm. Upon her return, she observed the SC on her back and water had covered most of her head and face. The SM stated she called out for help, but the MGGM who is hearing impaired had fallen asleep did not respond. The SM called 911 and was instructed to administer CPR. The MA arrived at the home shortly after the discovery and directed EMS to the case address. The SS was at school at the time of the incident and the MGM was not home.

On 5/22/19, ACS contacted the LE, CPH staff and first responders. ACS learned from LE there was no foul play and no arrest was made; it appeared accidental. The Dr. described the SC's prognosis as grim.

NY-19-071 FINAL Page 5 of 10



The Specialist interviewed several close relatives at the hospital including the PGM, MU, MA. All denied knowledge of drug use or mental illness by the SM; they all stated she is a good, attentive mother. The Specialist documented the SS was safe; the home had clutter but there were no hazardous conditions.

The BF was interviewed at the hospital and he told the Specialist that he resides in another state. He explained that he is constantly in contact with his family, and they have a close bond. The BF stated he never observed the SM leave the SC unattended and she is a very good mother. He reported he learned of the incident from the SM who called him just after she called 911 but he could not understand what she said due to the commotion. She informed him fifteen minutes later while she was in the ambulance.

ACS held a Child Safety Conference with the parents and discussed the discrepancies regarding the incident. The SM reported the SC's head was not facing the faucet as reported. Also, the adult bathtub contained water. The SM explained that the SS usually assists her when she gives the SC a bath; however, he was not home. The SM reiterated she thought the SC would not move because of her age and that was the first time she had ever left the SC unattended. The SS said he always helped his mother and that she never left he or his sister alone; she was a great mother. The SM and BF denied mental illness and drug use. ACS referred the family to services but they declined. The SM and SS moved out of state to live with the BF.

According to the case documentation, the SC was hospitalized for one month before the parents gave permission to remove the life support. The ME listed the cause of death was complications of drowning and the manner was accidental.

On 8/21/19, ACS indicated the allegations of DOA/ fatality, IG and LS of the SC by the SM. ACS cited the SM's admission to leaving the SC unattended in a tub of water. ACS unsubstantiated the same allegations by the MGM as the MGM was not home.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Accident

Primary Cause of Death: From an injury - external cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Hospital physician

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? No

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? No

Comments: The here is no OCFS approved CFRT in New York City.

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s) Allegation(s)		Allegation Outcome
052194 - Deceased Child, Female, 2	052223 - Grandparent, Female, 62	Inadequate	Unsubstantiated
Mons	Year(s)	Guardianship	
052194 - Deceased Child, Female, 2 Mons	052195 - Mother, Female, 28 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Substantiated
052194 - Deceased Child, Female, 2	052223 - Grandparent, Female, 62	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated
Mons	Year(s)		

NY-19-071 FINAL Page 6 of 10

NEW YORK STATE	Office of Children and Family Services
----------------------	--

052194 - Deceased Child, Female, 2	052223 - Grandparent, Female, 62	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
Mons	Year(s)		
052194 - Deceased Child, Female, 2	052195 - Mother, Female, 28 Year(s)	Inadequate	Substantiated
Mons		Guardianship	
052194 - Deceased Child, Female, 2	052195 - Mother, Female, 28 Year(s)	Lack of Supervision	Substantiated
Mons			

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	\boxtimes			
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	\boxtimes			
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	\boxtimes			
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	\boxtimes			
Contact with source?	\boxtimes			
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	\boxtimes			
Was a death-scene investigation performed?				
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?				
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	\boxtimes			
Did the investigation adhere to established protocols for a joint investigation?				
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	\boxtimes			

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	\boxtimes			
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report:	urviving	siblings/o	ther child	lren in the
Within 24 hours?	\boxtimes			
At 7 days?	\boxtimes			
At 30 days?	\boxtimes			
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?	\boxtimes			
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?				

NY-19-071 FINAL Page 7 of 10



When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?							
Fatali	ty Risk Asse	ssment / Ris	k Assessment	t Profile			
				Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate	in this case	?					
During the course of the investigation, w gathered to assess risk to all surviving si household?				\boxtimes			
Was there an adequate assessment of the	e family's n	eed for se	rvices?				
Did the protective factors in this case red in Family Court at any time during or a	-		-				
Were appropriate/needed services offere	ed in this ca	ase					
				1		•	
Placement	Activities in	Response to	the Fatality	Investigatio	on		
				Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the siblings/other children in the household care at any time during this fatality inve	be remove		0		\boxtimes		
Were there surviving children in the hou as a result of this fatality report / investito this fatality?					\boxtimes		
Explain as necessary: The SS remained in the custody of his pare	ents.			•	•	•	
	Legal Activ	ity Related	to the Fatality	y			
Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.							
Services P	rovided to tl	he Family in	Response to	the Fatality	y		
	Duovidad	Offered	Offered		Noodo	1	CDD
Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavaila	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling		\boxtimes					
Economic support							
Funeral arrangements							

NY-19-071 FINAL Page 8 of 10

VORK STATE and Family Services	Child	Fatality	y Report	t			
Housing assistance							
Mental health services						\boxtimes	
Foster care							
Health care							
Legal services						\boxtimes	
Family planning						\boxtimes	
Homemaking Services							
Parenting Skills						\boxtimes	
Domestic Violence Services						\boxtimes	
Early Intervention						\boxtimes	
Alcohol/Substance abuse						\boxtimes	
Child Care						\boxtimes	
Intensive case management						\boxtimes	
Family or others as safety resources						\boxtimes	
Other						\boxtimes	
Were services provided to parent(s) and fatality? No Explain: The parents declined services.					incous rem		
	History	Prior to t	he Fatality	y			
	C	hild Informa	ation				
Did the child have a history of alleged ch Was the child ever placed outside of the	home prior	to the dea	th?			No No	
Were there any siblings ever placed outs		-	to this chil	d's death?		No	
Was the child acutely ill during the two	weeks deioi	re death?				No	
	Infants	Under One	Year Old				
During pregnancy, mother: ☐ Had medical complications / infections ☐ Misused over-the-counter or prescription ☐ Experienced domestic violence ☐ Was not noted in the case record to have	on drugs	11.		☐ Had heav☐ Smoked☐ Used illic		se	

NY-19-071 FINAL Page 9 of 10

 $\hfill \square$ With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome

Infant was born:

☐ Drug exposed

With neither of the issues listed noted in case record



CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

	CPS - Investigati	ve History Three Yea	ars Prior to the Fatal	lity	
Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
05/22/2019	Deceased Child, Female, 2 Months	Mother, Female, 27 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated	No
	Deceased Child, Female, 2 Months	Mother, Female, 27 Years	Lack of Supervision	Substantiated	
SM returne EMS was c	, at approximately 1:45 PM, the Sd to find the SC submerged in the	water, blue in color and		as intubated a	
negligence. OCFS Rev The investi	ntiated the allegations of IG and ACS noted that it was a horrific aiew Results: gation was thorough and the alleg Required Actions related to the	accident. ations were appropriately compliance issue(s)?	y substantiated. Yes ⊠No		gment and
There was n	o CPS history more than three ye	History More Than Three ars prior to the fatality.	Tears into to the ratant	y	
		Known CPS History Outsid	e of NYS		
There is no Ω	known CPS history outside of NY	YS.			
Was there	Legal Hist	tory Within Three Years Pi		vas no legal ac	tivity
		Recommended Action	n(s)		
Are there a	ny recommended actions for lo	cal or state administrati	ve or policy changes?	□Yes ⊠No	
Are there a	ny recommended prevention ac	tivities resulting from t	he review? □Yes ⊠N	lo	

NY-19-071 FINAL Page 10 of 10