

Report Identification Number: BU-19-018

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

**Issue Date: Oct 31, 2019** 

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:  A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



# Abbreviations

Relationships					
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child			
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child			
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father			
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider			
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father			
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle			
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub			
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult				
	Contacts				
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner			
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services			
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother			
CPS-Child Protective Services					
	Allegations				
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts			
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding			
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse			
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect			
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive			
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision			
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other				
	Miscellaneous				
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender			
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence			
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police			
Service	Services	Department			
PPRS-Purchased Preventive	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy	FC-Foster Care			
Rehabilitative Services	Families				
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services			
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan			
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment			
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old			
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation					



### **Case Information**

**Report Type:** Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Erie **Date of Death:** 05/12/2019

Age: 17 year(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 05/15/2019

#### **Presenting Information**

A 7065 Reporting Form was submitted which stated on 5/12/19, the 17-year-old subject child was involved in a car accident and died at the scene of the crash. His death occurred during an open CPS services case.

### **Executive Summary**

This fatality report concerns the death of a 17-year-old male subject child (SC) that occurred on 5/12/19. The child died during an open CPS services case that was initiated by Erie County Department of Social Services (ECDSS) in January 2019. This services case was opened due to ongoing drugs use concerns regarding the mother of the child (BM). A completed 7065 Reporting Form was sent to OCFS on 5/13/19. An autopsy was completed; however, the final report was not available at the time of this writing. The official cause and manner of death remained pending.

At the time of the child's death, he and his four siblings, ages 13, 11, 8, and 3, were in the custody of the child's step-father (parent substitute, PS); the 3-year-old sibling was the only biological child of the parent substitute. ECDSS obtained information via interviews and police reports surrounding the subject child's death and the events leading up to fatal incident. It was determined the child attended a party at a friend's house on the evening of 5/11/19 with the permission of his step-father, and he did not return home that night. Police reports revealed the child and five of his friends, all minors, went to several parties throughout the night and were consuming alcohol. At approximately 5:00 AM on 5/12/19, the child and his friends were driving to the home of another peer; the child was the driver of the vehicle. When approaching an intersection, the child lost control of the car, causing it to hit a tree stump and flip onto its roof in a nearby driveway; the car then caught fire. The five passengers were able to exit vehicle, and the homeowner of where the car landed contacted 911; EMS quickly arrived at the scene. At first it was unclear if anyone else was in the vehicle, as small explosions forced first responders to retreat from the car. The fire department arrived and as the fire was controlled, the child was found still in the driver's seat, deceased. The police ruled alcohol was a factor in the crash, as well as a speed of at least 51 miles per hour in a 35 mile per hour zone.

When ECDSS learned of the child's death, they promptly assessed the safety of the siblings and offered services to the family. It was discovered neither the child's parents nor his step-father had concerns surrounding any alcohol use or reckless driving, and it was not unusual for the child to spend the night at a friend's house. There was no criminality found on behalf of anyone involved, nor was there any cause to suspect the step-father's actions or inaction led to the fatality. ECDSS gathered sufficient information surrounding the incident, and the CPS services remained open and ongoing at the time of this writing.

## Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

#### **Safety Assessment:**

- Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:
  - Safety assessment due at the time of determination?

N/A

BU-19-018 FINAL Page 3 of 12



-		•	. •	
1)6	teri	nin	atıo	n

<b>Determination:</b>		
	on gathered to make determination(s) for all ntified in the course of the investigation?	allegations N/A
• Was the determination nappropriate?	nade by the district to unfound or indicate	N/A
-	ensurate with the case circumstances. This was essments nor was there an investigation determi	•
Was the decision to close the cas	se appropriate?	N/A
Was casework activity commen regulatory requirements?	surate with appropriate and relevant statuto	ry or Yes
Was there sufficient documenta	tion of supervisory consultation?	Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.
Explain:		
The case remained open for servi	ces at the time of this writing.	
	Required Actions Related to the Fatality	
Are there Required Actions rela	ated to the compliance issue(s)?	o
Fatal	ity-Related Information and Investigati	ve Activities
	Incident Information	
	includit information	
<b>Date of Death:</b> 05/12/2019	Time of Death: 05:	00 AM (Approximate)
Time of fatal incident, if differe	nt than time of death:	Unknown
County where fatality incident of	occurred:	Erie
Was 911 or local emergency nur		Yes
Time of Call:		Unknown
Did EMS respond to the scene?		Yes
At time of incident leading to de	eath, had child used alcohol or drugs?	Unknown
Child's activity at time of incide		
☐ Sleeping	Working	Driving / Vehicle occupant
☐ Playing	☐ Eating	Unknown
Other		

Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to death? No - Not needed given developmental age or circumstances

Total number of deaths at incident event:

Children ages 0-18: 1

BU-19-018 **FINAL** Page 4 of 12



Adults: 0

#### **Household Composition at time of Fatality**

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	No Role	Male	17 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Male	13 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	12 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	8 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Male	3 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Stepfather	No Role	Male	40 Year(s)

#### **LDSS Response**

On 5/13/19, ECDSS submitted a completed 7065 Reporting Form to OCFS regarding the death of SC, which occurred on 5/12/19. At the time of SC's death, there was an ongoing CPS services case involving the family which was opened in January 2019. The concerns that were being addressed in this services case were not related to the fatality nor the circumstances surrounding such.

PS had texted the ECDSS case planner on 5/13/19 to inform her of SC's passing the previous day. Upon learning of SC's death, ECDSS promptly reached out to PS to offer condolences and any assistance during his time of grief. ECDSS spoke with PS briefly on this date, and he explained SC had been the driver in a car with 5 of his friends as passengers when they were involved in an accident around 5:00 AM on 5/12/19. PS stated he learned that as SC approached an intersection he lost control of the vehicle. PS stated he heard SC had been driving around 80 miles per hour, hit a tree stump, and the car then rolled onto its roof and caught fire. PS reported the 5 passengers exited or were pulled from the vehicle; however, EMS did not realize SC was still in the car, and SC did not survive. PS stated alcohol may have been involved. PS stated he works late shifts, but SC did inform him the evening of 5/11/19 that he was going to a party at a friend's house. PS stated he texted SC around 10:00 PM to see if he was staying over or coming home. PS stated SC informed him via text he was not sure. PS stated at 1:00 AM on 5/12/19, he texted SC to inform him he was leaving for work and would leave the door open for him if he chose to return home. He stated SC responded "ok" and that was last he heard from him.

On 5/13/19, ECDSS assessed the safety of the SS and offered BM and BF condolences. The SS appeared safe at that time. ECDSS again met with PS in his home on 5/14/19 to see how he and the SS were doing and to offer services. ECDSS also attended a candlelight vigil in the community for SC on this same date.

On 5/29/19, ECDSS met with PS to further discuss the fatality. PS denied any knowledge that SC drank alcohol or used drugs; SC did drink once at a party in the past but he and BM discussed this with SC and "it seemed like a non-issue." PS stated he had spoken to SC about the dangers of drinking and driving and to always call him if he needed a ride. PS stated he never saw any "red flags" with SC, and he did not have a history of reckless driving or behavior. PS stated it was normal for SC to stay out for the night, and he was usually over at his best friend's house. PS stated his expectations were that SC let him know where he was going and where he would be staying if he was not coming home. PS stated he was lenient with SC because SC had never given him a reason not to trust him. PS had no other information.

ECDSS also spoke with BM and BF regarding the fatality, and offered them appropriate services. Neither parent reported any concerns regarding SC drinking or using drugs, and denied any knowledge of reckless driving. BM stated SC did stay the night at his best friend's home often. They had no further information surrounding the events as SC resided with PS.



ECDSS obtained the police reports regarding the accident and requested the autopsy report, which had not yet been completed at the time of this writing. The police reports noted alcohol, speed, inexperienced driving, and unfamiliarity with the roads as causes behind the crash. Police statements from the survivors indicated they and SC had been drinking beer for several hours leading up to the accident, and most individuals in the car were not wearing seat belts; it was unknown if SC was wearing a seat belt. There were no criminal charges in relation to the accident, and the CPS services case remained open and ongoing.

## Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Accident

**Primary Cause of Death:** From an injury - external cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

#### Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team?Yes

**Comments:** This fatality was reviewed by the Erie County Child Fatality Review Team.

## **CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities**

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?				
When appropriate, children were interviewed?				
Contact with source?			$\boxtimes$	
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?		$\boxtimes$		
First Responders		$\boxtimes$		
Was a death-scene investigation performed?				
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?			$\boxtimes$	
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?				

#### **Additional information:**

ECDSS spoke with family members and collateral sources surrounding SC's death. Police reports were obtained; however, the record did not reflect attempts to speak with EMS. Progress notes and all other required documentation were entered timely.

#### **Fatality Safety Assessment Activities**

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	$\boxtimes$			

Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to surviving siblings/other children in the household named in the report:



Within 24 hours?			$\boxtimes$	
At 7 days?			$\boxtimes$	
At 30 days?			$\boxtimes$	
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?				
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?				
When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?			$\boxtimes$	
Explain: This was not an SCR reported fatality; however, the safety of the SS was asses	sed on nu	merous oc	ecasions.	
Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment	Profile			
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case?			$\boxtimes$	
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there an adequate assessment of the family's need for services?	$\boxtimes$			
Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation?		$\boxtimes$		
Were appropriate/needed services offered in this case	$\boxtimes$			
Explain: SC died while the family was involved in an open services case. The case remarkeriting, and the family continued to receive services.	nined oper	n and ongo	oing at the	time of this
Placement Activities in Response to the Fatality In	nvestigatio	n		
	8			
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving siblings/other children in the household be removed or placed in foster care at any time during this fatality investigation?				
Were there surviving children in the household that were removed either as a result of this fatality report / investigation or for reasons unrelated to this fatality?				
Explain as necessary: The SS were placed in the care of PS in December 2018. They remained safe in	n PS' care	after SC's	s death.	

BU-19-018 FINAL Page 7 of 12



### Legal Activity Related to the Fatality

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.

Have any Orders of Protection been issued? No
---

## Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling							
<b>Economic support</b>						$\boxtimes$	
Funeral arrangements				$\boxtimes$			
Housing assistance						$\boxtimes$	
Mental health services							
Foster care						$\boxtimes$	
Health care							
Legal services							
Family planning				$\boxtimes$			
Homemaking Services							
Parenting Skills							
<b>Domestic Violence Services</b>							
Early Intervention							
Alcohol/Substance abuse							
Child Care							
Intensive case management							
Family or others as safety resources							
Other							

## Additional information, if necessary:

Appropriate services were offered to family members in response to SC's death. A CPS services case remained ongoing at the time of this writing.

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? Yes

### **Explain:**

ECDSS provided the caregivers with bereavement referrals for the SS. The SS were also able to speak with school social workers if they felt the need.



Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

## **Explain:**

ECDSS provided the caregivers with referrals for bereavement counseling.

## **History Prior to the Fatality**

#### **Child Information**

Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment?

Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death?

Yes

Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death?

Yes

Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?

No

## **CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality**

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
11/27/2018	Deceased Child, Male, 16 Years	Mother, Female, 43 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated	No
	Deceased Child, Male, 16 Years	Mother, Female, 43 Years	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Substantiated	
	Sibling, Male, 13 Years	Mother, Female, 43 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated	
	Sibling, Male, 13 Years	Mother, Female, 43 Parents Drug / Alcohol Years Misuse		Substantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 11 Years	Mother, Female, 43 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 11 Years	Mother, Female, 43 Years	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Substantiated	
	Sibling, Female, 8 Years	Mother, Female, 43 Years	her, Female, 43 Parents Drug / Alcohol		
	Sibling, Female, 8 Years	Mother, Female, 43 Years			
	Sibling, Male, 3 Years	Mother, Female, 43 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated	
	Sibling, Male, 3 Years	Mother, Female, 43 Years	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Substantiated	

### Report Summary:

This report was received with concerns BM was taking the CHN with her to a "crack house", to buy and use crack. The report further alleged BM would sometimes use the crack in the car while the CHN were present. On 11/22/18, BM was arrested for Endangering the Welfare of a Child. The role of PS was unknown.

BU-19-018 FINAL Page 9 of 12



Report Determination: Indicated Da	te of Dete	rmination	02/22/2	010	
Basis for Determination:	ite of Dete	101111111111111111111111111111111111111	1. U <i>LI LLI L</i>	UIJ	
ECDSS completed a full investigation into the allegations which incleollateral sources. The investigation revealed BM was using crack confidence of the CHN. A Neglect Petition was filed against BM by the department PS. The case was opened for CPS services.	ocaine and	attempted	to swallo	w such in	the presence
OCFS Review Results: This investigation met all statutory requirements.					
Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)?	Yes 🔯	No			
CPS - Investigative History More Than Three	ee Years Pri	or to the F	atality		
From October 2008 to November 2015, SC and the SS were listed as allegations of IG, LS, IF/C/S, PD/AM, LMC, XCP, L/B/W, and SA.  Known CPS History Outsi	Of these 20		_		nmon
There was no known CPS history outside of NYS.					
Services Open at the Time	of the Fa	tality			
Was the deceased child(ren) involved in an open Child Protective  Date the Child Protective Services case was opened: 01/11/2019  Evaluative Review of Services that were Open				the fatali	ty? Yes
			·		
		Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the service provider(s) comply with the timeliness and conte requirements for progress notes?	nt				
Did the services provided meet the service needs as outlined in the record?	ne case				
Did all service providers comply with mandated reporter requir	ements?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there information in the case record that indicated the exist behaviors or conditions that placed the children in the case in daincreased their risk of harm?					
Casework Contac	ets				
		Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
					Determine
Did the service provider comply with case work contacts, include to-face contact as required by regulations pertaining to the progenoice?	_				
to-face contact as required by regulations pertaining to the prog	ram				

BU-19-018 FINAL Page 10 of 12



	<b>T</b> 7	<b>*</b> Y	<b>3</b> 777	<b>Unable to</b>
	Yes	No	N/A	Determine
Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality?				
Were services provided to parents as necessary to achieve safety, permanency, and well-being?				
Family Assessment and Service Plan (FAS	P)			
Tanny Assessment and Service Han (1716)	<u>,, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,</u>			
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the most recent FASP approved on time?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there a current Risk Assessment Profile/Risk Assessment in the most recent FASP?	$\boxtimes$			
Was the FASP consistent with the case circumstances?	$\boxtimes$			
Closing				
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the decision to close the Services case appropriate?			$\square$	
Preventive Services History				
In December 2008, a preventive services case was opened due to the parents' un CHN attended needed medical appointments. There was also interpersonal viole was linked to appropriate services and were compliant. The family was discharg It was noted the parents appeared to be meeting the needs of all the children and warrant continued involvement.  In December 2018, SC and the SS were removed from BM due to ongoing conception through with treatment recommendations. A Neglect Petition was filed as implemented which stated ECDSS would supervise all visits between BM and the CHN's biological father did not have the appropriate resources to house and were placed in the 1017 custody of PS. A CPS services case was opened in respective CPS services case remained open and ongoing at the time of this writing.	erns surrogainst BM care for to	een the BM reventive re no addi ounding dr I and an o At the tim he CHN;	M and BF services in tional control was an arder of sure of the Natherefore,	. The family in May 2010. Incerns to ad failure to pervision was leglect filing, the CHN
Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the	Fatality			
Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investiga  ☐ Criminal Court	ation?	er of Prote	ction	

BU-19-018 FINAL Page 11 of 12



Family Court Petition Type: FCA Article 10 - CPS					
Date Filed:	Fact Finding Description:	Disposition Description:			
12/05/2018	There was not a fact finding	Direct Custody to/or Continued with Relative (Article 10)			
Respondent:	051301 Other				
Comments:	A Neglect Petition was filed against BM due to her ongoing drug use and overall inability to appropriately care for the CHN. An order of supervision was implemented which stated ECDSS would supervise all visits between BM and the CHN. A CPS services case was opened in response, and services began in January 2019. The CPS services case remained open and ongoing at the time of this writing.				

Have any Orders of Protection been issued? Yes				
From: Unknown	To: Unknown			
Explain: Family Court ordered ECDSS supervise any visitation between BM and the CHN.				
Additional Local District Comments				
We at the Erie County Department of Social Services appreciate the opportunity given us to review the draft report in advance. We find that the facts, as written, describe the unfortunate events and the actions taken in response. We are pleased that OCFS found our response to the fatality appropriate, and we are also pleased that OCFS found no required actions related to the fatality or to the CPS investigation conducted during the three years preceding the fatality.				
Recommended Action(s)				
Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes?   Yes No				
Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? Yes No				

BU-19-018 FINAL Page 12 of 12